

Application Number	14/0967/FUL	Agenda Item	
Date Received	18th June 2014	Officer	Mr Sav Patel
Target Date	13th August 2014		
Ward	Newnham		
Site	Cambridge Rugby Union Football Club Volac Park, Grantchester Road Cambridge CB3 9ED		
Proposal	Erection of replacement changing rooms, replacement dug outs and the retention of the existing temporary changing rooms for a period of 3 years.		
Applicant	c/o Agent United Kingdom		

SUMMARY	<p>The development accords with the Development Plan for the following reasons:</p> <p>The proposed development would not have any adverse impact on the openness of the Green Belt</p> <p>The proposed development is of good design and ancillary scale to the existing grandstand and rural context.</p> <p>The proposed development would not have any adverse impact on the residential amenity of the surrounding residents.</p>
RECOMMENDATION	APPROVAL

1.0 SITE DESCRIPTION/AREA CONTEXT

- 1.1 Cambridge Rugby Club is situated on the west side of Grantchester Road and to the south of Fulbrooke Road, on the edge of the built-up area of the city.
- 1.2 The access road to the rugby club is from off Grantchester Road, and runs along the northern boundary of the clubs playing pitches, adjacent to the rear gardens of the dwellings of

Fulbrooke Road. The access road then extends along approximately half the length of the western side of the playing field area, to the grandstand, a two-storey, pitched-roofed building adjacent to the western boundary of the rugby club site. There is a single-storey, pitched-roofed extension to the southern end of the clubhouse, and on the southern end of this extension, is a ramshackle timber structure, and several single-storey, flat-roofed portable structures, that apparently comprise changing rooms and stores.

- 1.3 Along the western boundary of the rugby club site, is a water-filled ditch, with shrubs and trees intermittently along its length. The southern boundary of the rugby club site is similarly delineated by sporadic trees and shrubs. Beyond the western and southern boundaries are open fields. On the other side of Grantchester Road, on the eastern side of the rugby club site, are the pavilion and playing fields of Downing College.
- 1.4 Younger trees have been planted along the western and southern boundaries of the rugby club site to fill the gaps in the mature line of trees along these boundaries. This additional planting was a requirement of a previous planning permission for the installation of floodlighting columns (Planning reference C/02/0483). These newly-planted trees, and the existing established trees on all boundaries of the rugby club site, are protected by a Tree Preservation Order (TPO).
- 1.5 Around that sports pitch immediately in front of the grandstand building, there is an approximately 1 metre high post-and-rail timber fence, with advertising signs attached to the fence along three sides of the pitch. There is also a much higher score board structure on the side of the pitch opposite the clubhouse.
- 1.6 The application site is in the Green Belt and in an area designated as Protected Open Space in the Cambridge Local Plan (2006). As mentioned above, all the trees on the rugby club site are protected by a TPO. The site is also located within a Flood Zone 3.

2.0 THE PROPOSAL

- 2.1 The proposal comprises erection of replacement changing rooms, replacement dug-outs and retention of the existing temporary changing rooms for a period of 3 years.

- 2.2 The existing changing facilities are located in temporary portacabin structures for which the temporary permission expired on 31st March 2014. Prior to the expiration of the temporary permission, the applicant held pre-application advice with officers over the prospect of replacing the existing changing facilities. Whilst the temporary permission has expired, officers are content to allow the club to use the facilities until after the outcome of this application.
- 2.3 The replacement facilities have been shown in two phases (1 and 2). Phase 1 is proposed to house unisex changing, showers and toilet facilities, a gym, physio room, laundry room, separate mens toilets and match preparation room. Phase 2 is proposed to house a multi-purpose room, unisex changing rooms including shower and toilets. Phase 2 is the smaller of the two phases.
- 2.4 Phase 1 and would be connected via a flat roof link. Both phase 1 and 2 however would have a pitched roof and be single storey. Both phases are proposed to be external timber clad with feather edge boarding, cedar shingle roof tiles and a low brick base surround. The pitched roof of phase 1 would have a ridge running parallel to the playing pitch. The ridge of the phase 2 roof would run crossways, presenting a gable end to the pitch.
- 2.5 There would be a slight variation in height between the two phases with phase 1 being 5.35 metres in height (to the ridge) and phase 2 being slightly higher at 5.45 metres. Phase 1 would be 13.3 metres depth and 20.7 metres wide whereas phase 2 would be 12.7 metres in depth and 12 metres wide. The link section between both phases would be 2 metres wide and set in front the front elevations. Phase 1 would also include a flat roof veranda section on the eastern elevation that would provide a covered area for spectators to stand under.
- 2.6 The proposal also seeks retrospective planning permission for two dug outs that are located adjacent to the first team pitch. The dug outs are 2 metres in height with a shallow sloping roof and 4.7 metres wide.

- 2.7 The proposal also seeks temporary consent for a period of 3 year for the existing changing facilities in order to give the club enough time to raise funds to pay for phase 1 and 2.
- 2.8 For background, planning permission was granted in 2007 for a similar single storey extension to the side of the existing grandstand. However, the proposed extension was considered to be unacceptable due to its poor design and bulk appearance. The extension was also considered to have a detrimental impact on the openness of the greenbelt.
- 2.9 In 2008 (08/0382/FUL) a subsequent application was submitted for a two storey extension to the existing grandstand providing four additional changing rooms with a gym and lounge area at first floor. However, due to cost implications the club were unable to implement this permission.
- 2.10 In October 2013 the club applied for pre-application advice to discuss the proposal to redevelop the existing temporary changing facilities. The proposed scheme was considered and following some amendments received officer level support. Following this, a public exhibition was held on 7 May 2014 to invite members of the public to view and comment on the proposed extension. Overall no adverse comments were made regarding the design.
- 2.11 The submitted planning application is accompanied by the following supporting information:
1. Design and Access Statement
 2. Planning Statement
 3. Flood Risk Assessment
 4. Transport Statement
 5. Preliminary Ecology Appraisal
 6. Statement of Community Involvement
 7. Plans

3.0 SITE HISTORY

Reference	Description	Outcome
07/0165/FUL	Amended first floor terrace and staircase plus rear external staircase (amendment to application 04/1352/FUL)	APPROVED

07/1376/FUL	Single storey side extension, re-roofing existing single storey building and erection of detached storage shed.	REFUSED
08/0179/FUL	Alterations and extensions to existing Clubhouse and facilities (renewal of planning permission C/03/0143/FP)	APPROVED
08/0382/FUL	Erection of two storey extension and associated works (amended design to application C/03/0143/FP).	APPROVED
11/0087/EXP	Extension of time for the implementation of planning permission reference 08/0382/FUL for the erection of two storey extension and associated works (amended design to application C/03/0143/FP).	APPROVED
11/1078/FUL	Retention of temporary changing rooms and ancillary floorspace.	APPROVED

4.0 PUBLICITY

4.1	Advertisement:	No
	Adjoining Owners:	Yes
	Site Notice Displayed:	No
	Public Meeting/Exhibition (meeting of 7 May 2014):	Yes

5.0 POLICY

5.1 Central Government Advice

National Planning Policy Framework 2012
National Planning Practice Guidance 2014
Community Infrastructure Levy Regulations 2010
Circular 11/95 – The Use of Conditions in Planning Permissions
(Annex A)

5.2 Cambridge Local Plan 2006

3/1 Sustainable development
3/3 Setting of the City
3/4 Responding to context
3/7 Creating successful places
3/11 The design of external spaces
3/12 The design of new buildings
3/14 Extending buildings

4/1 Green Belt
4/2 Protection of open space
4/4 Trees

6/1 Protection of leisure facilities

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

Cambridgeshire County Council (Engineering)

6.1 No comments to make.

Head of Refuse and Environment

6.2 No objections in principle subject to conditions on construction hours and plant/building noise insulation.

Urban Design and Conservation

6.3 The proposed application is supported in design terms. The arrangement and appearance of the phase 1 and 2 extensions are acceptable in design terms. The pitched roof elements joined by flat roof linking sections help break up and articulate the roofline.

Drainage Officer

6.4 The proposals are located within Flood Zone 3 and even if the development is classified as 'water compatible' it must not increase flood risk elsewhere. The foot print of the proposed development will take up volume that would be taken up by flood water in an extreme event. This can be compensated against by the provision of volume for volume flood mitigation storage area.

6.5 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

7.0 REPRESENTATIONS

7.1 The owners/occupiers of the following addresses have made representations:

- The Orchard, Queens Close, Harston;
- 11 Pieces Lane, Waterbeach
- 15 Church Road, Teversham
- 60 Carlyle Road
- 21 Fulbrooke Road (Objector)
- 76 West Fen Road, Ely
- 17 Bishops Road
- Duke Court, 56 Newmarket Road
- Tillbrook House, Church Lane, Comberton
- 10 Wensum Way, Ely
- 24 Church Street, Haslingfield
- The Old Vicarage, Mill Way, Grantchester
- 6 Stukeley Close
- 54 Stanley Court
- 29 Gough Way
- 119 High Street, Linton
- 269 Arbury Road
- 45 Haig Court, Union Lane
- 42 Riddy Lane, Bourn
- 2 Millington Road
- 3 Ambrose Way, Impington
- 36 Harding Way
- 61 Broadway, Grantchester
- 90 Grantchester Meadows
- 5 Impetts Lane, Fulbourn

7.2 23 of the 24 third party representations received are in support of the application proposal.

7.3 The representation of objection can be summarised as follows:

- Object to the unsightly position of the dug-outs;
- Object to the unsightly existence of the temporary buildings

7.4 The above representations are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the representations can be inspected on the application file.

8.0 ASSESSMENT

8.1 From the consultation responses and representations received and from my inspection of the site and the surroundings, I consider that the main issues are:

1. Principle of development
2. Temporary consent
3. Context of site, design and external spaces
4. Residential amenity
5. Third party representations

Principle of development

8.2 The site is located within the Green Belt. Policy 4/1 (Green Belt) would therefore apply any proposal within the Green Belt. The policy states that there is a presumption against inappropriate development in the Green Belt in order to preserve the unique character of Cambridge; maintain and enhance the quality of its setting and prevent communities from merging.

8.3 The proposed development is not considered to be inappropriate development as it not only relates to an existing use but also because it would essentially replace an existing structure. Therefore, it would not result in new development on virgin Green Belt land. Nevertheless, paragraph 98 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) sets out the types of developments that are classified as being appropriate within the Green Belt. This includes:

“...facilities for outdoor sport, outdoor recreation and for cemeteries, as long as it preserves the openness of the Green Belt and does not conflict with the purpose of including land within it”.

8.4 The proposals are not only essential to the continuation of the sports club but also to the local community to which the club has an active engagement. Therefore, in my view the proposed development is not considered to be inappropriate development in the Green Belt. The proposal would replace the existing

facilities which are in poor condition and do not preserve or enhance the setting of the Green Belt. I am therefore satisfied that the proposed development would not have a detrimental impact on the openness of the Green Belt such that it would warrant refusal.

Temporary Consent

- 8.5 The proposal for an extension of time to retain the existing changing facilities would give the rugby club the comfort of implementing the proposed development, if approved, at their own pace. Whilst the existing facilities are in poor conditions, it is the rugby club's aspiration, once sufficient funds have been raised, to implement any permission. I understand the club are keen to remove and replace the existing changing facilities at the earliest opportunity. Therefore the temporary consent of 3 years to the existing changing facilities would help the club to facilitate funding to achieve their aspiration. Whilst this is not ideal, it would give the club a form of security and comfort knowing that even if they implement part of the proposed development, if approved, that they would not need to remove the existing changing structures altogether.

Context of site, design and external spaces

- 8.6 The proposed replacement changing facilities would extend off an existing single storey brick built building which is connected to the main grandstand. The extensions; phase 1 and 2, would therefore give the impression of three interconnected single storey buildings extending off the grandstand. The proposed buildings are proposed to be timber clad with cedar shingle roofs. This approach to the external appearance of the buildings is considered to be sympathetic to the Green Belt setting of the site by allowing the buildings to appear ancillary and less intrusive. The buildings have been designed to appear functional rather than to stand out, which I consider to be a suitable approach for this site.
- 8.7 The flat roof links between the existing and two proposed elements helps to break up the bulk and scale of the extensions, and the gable ending of the phase 2 extension gives architectural interest to the row of extensions and appears as a book end. Phase 1 and 2 are proposed to have a slightly higher ridgeline than the existing single storey element but it

would not be materially noticeable mainly because each element would read as a separate element linked by a flat roof section. The phase 2 would extend beyond the footprint of the existing structures by 9.4 metres. However, this would be 400mm short of the footprint of the 2008 approved extension.

- 8.8 Therefore I am satisfied that the proposed extensions would be acceptable for this location. The extensions are of a scale and design that would enhance the existing condition of the site and provide the club with sufficient accommodation to continue their growth as a community facility.
- 8.9 The dug-out structures, which are in-situ; on the opposite the grandstand and on the opposite side of the first team pitch, are of ancillary scale and are of a fit for purpose design. I have no adverse comments to make on the location or appearance of the dug-outs.
- 8.10 In terms impact on the wildlife, the applicant's ecological appraisal (by MLM Consulting EngineersLtd) conclude that the proposed development would result in the loss of a small area of habitat to the south of the existing portacabins. However, the habitat lost is not considered to be of ecological value. However, the habitats to the western boundary of the site adjacent to the proposed development where there is a dyke, hedgerow and glassland to the south do have some ecological value but would not be affected by the proposal. Nevertheless, the appraisal recommends that as these habitats have the potential to support reptiles and therefore efforts should be made to maintain the current development area to avoid any suitable encroachment that could affect colonisation.
- 8.11 In my opinion the proposals are compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 3/4, 3/7, 3/11, 3/12 and 3/14.

Residential Amenity

Impact on amenity of neighbouring occupiers

- 8.12 There are no dwellings within close proximity to the proposed extensions that would be affected. View of the proposed extensions would be screened from the residents in Fulbrooke Road by the existing grandstand building. Furthermore, the extensions would be a significant distance from nearby

residents such that it would be difficult to argue the extension and the use of it would cause any adverse impact.

- 8.13 The dug-outs are located in a visible location on the edge of the playing field opposite the grandstand. Whilst the dug-outs are visible, they are of a modest scale and design. On this basis, it would be difficult to argue they would have any significant adverse visual impact on the outlook from the residents in Fulbrooke Road or Grantchester Road.
- 8.14 In my opinion the proposal adequately respects the residential amenity of its neighbours and the constraints of the site and I consider that it is compliant with and Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policies 3/4 and 3/7.
- 8.15 In my opinion the proposal is compliant with Cambridge Local Plan (2006) policy 8/2.

Third Party Representations

- 8.16 I have addressed the concerns raised in the third party representations received for this application in the above section.

9.0 CONCLUSION

- 9.1 The club's current changing facilities are in poor condition and do not comply with the required current RFU standards. The proposed extensions would formalise the existing changing facilities by creating permanent, fit for purpose and RFU compliant changing facilities, which are of a design and scale that would allow them to sympathetically assimilate into this Green Belt setting without adversely affecting its openness. The dug-out structures are also acceptable in terms of their design and scale.
- 9.2 The proposal for a temporary consent of 3 years to allow the continued retention and use of the existing changing facilities is acceptable, as it would give the club security and comfort during their work to raise funds for the proposed development.
- 9.3 The proposed development including the dug-outs are considered to be acceptable and would be comply with policies 3/1, 3/4, 3/7, 3/12, 3/14, 4/1 and 4/2 of the Local Plan (2006).

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: In accordance with the requirements of section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans as listed on this decision notice.

Reason: In the interests of good planning, for the avoidance of doubt and to facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

3. No development shall take place until samples of the materials to be used in the construction of the external surfaces of the development hereby permitted have been made available for inspection on site and approved in writing by the local planning authority. Development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure that the appearance of the external surfaces is appropriate. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/4, 3/12 and 3/14)

4. Except with the prior written agreement of the local planning authority no construction work or demolition shall be carried out or plant operated other than between the following hours: 0800 hours to 1800 hours Monday to Friday, 0800 hours to 1300 hours on Saturday and at no time on Sundays, Bank or Public Holidays.

Reason: To protect the amenity of the adjoining properties. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/13)

5. Before the development hereby permitted is commenced details of the following matters shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority in writing.

i) contractors access arrangements for vehicles, plant and personnel,

ii) contractors site storage area/compound,

iii) the means of moving, storing and stacking all building materials, plant and equipment around and adjacent to the site,

iv) the arrangements for parking of contractors vehicles and contractors personnel vehicles.

Thereafter the development shall be undertaken in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To protect the amenity of the adjoining properties during the construction period. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/13)

6. Before the development/use hereby permitted is commenced, a scheme for the insulation of the building(s) and/or plant in order to minimise the level of noise emanating from the said building(s) and/or plant shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority and the scheme as approved shall be fully implemented before the use hereby permitted is commenced.

Reason: To protect the amenity of nearby properties (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policy 4/13)

7. Prior to any development, the hedge and trees within the existing western boundary of the site directly to the rear of the development hereby approved shall be retained and a protection zone for the hedge and trees shall be maintained for the duration of construction of the development, to the satisfaction of the local planning authority. Before construction commences, details of the method of protection of the boundary hedge and trees, and additional planting, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The agreed means of protection shall be retained on site until all equipment, and surplus materials have been removed from the site. Nothing shall be stored or placed in any area protected in accordance with this condition, and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered nor shall any excavation be made without the prior written approval of the local planning authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the details approved.

Reason: In the interests of visual amenity and to ensure retention of the hedge (Policy 3/4 of the Cambridge Local Plan 2006)

8. No development shall take place until details of flood proofing and resilience measures have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The scheme shall be implemented in accordance with the approved details. The flood proofing and resilience measures shall be:

Either ;

That floor levels within the proposed development are set no lower than existing levels AND, flood proofing of the proposed development has been incorporated where appropriate. Details of any flood proofing / resilience and resistance techniques, to be included in accordance with 'Improving the flood performance of new buildings' CLG (2007)

Or;

Floor levels within the extension will be set 300mm above the known or modelled 1 in 100 annual probability river flood (1%) or 1 in 200 annual probability sea flood (0.5%) in any year. This flood level is the extent of the Flood Zones This must be demonstrated by a plan that shows finished floor levels relative to the known or modelled flood level. All levels should be stated in relation to Ordnance Datum.

The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans.

Reason: To mitigate any adverse impact from flooding (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/7 and 4/13)

9. No development shall take place until a 'flood plain storage loss mitigation strategy' has been submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented in accordance with the approved strategy.

Reason: To mitigate any adverse impact from flooding (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/7 and 4/13)

10. The existing temporary changing buildings shall be removed (from the site) and the land restored to its former condition, on or before 8 September 2017.

Reason: The building construction and materials are considered inappropriate for more than a temporary period. (Cambridge Local Plan 2006 policies 3/1, 3/4 and 3/12)

11. To satisfy standard condition 6 (Noise Insulation), the rating level (in accordance with BS4142:1997) from all plant, equipment and vents etc (collectively) associated with this application should be less than or equal to the existing background level (L90) at the boundary of the premises subject to this application and having regard to noise sensitive premises.

Tonal/impulsive noise frequencies should be eliminated or at least considered in any assessment and should carry an additional 5 dB(A) correction. This is to guard against any creeping background noise in the area and prevent unreasonable noise disturbance to other premises. This requirement applies both during the day (0700 to 2300 hrs over any one hour period) and night time (2300 to 0700 hrs over any one 5 minute period).

It is recommended that the agent/applicant submits a noise prediction survey/report in accordance with the principles of BS4142: 1997 'Method for rating industrial noise affecting mixed residential and industrial areas' or similar, concerning the effects on amenity rather than likelihood for complaints. Noise levels shall be predicted at the boundary having regard to neighbouring premises.

Such a survey / report should include: a large scale plan of the site in relation to neighbouring premises; noise sources and measurement / prediction points marked on plan; a list of noise sources; details of proposed noise sources / type of plant such as: number, location, sound power levels, noise frequency spectrums, noise directionality of plant, noise levels from duct intake or discharge points; details of noise mitigation measures (attenuation details of any intended enclosures, silencers or barriers); description of full noise calculation procedures; noise levels at a representative sample of noise sensitive locations and hours of operation.

Any report shall include raw measurement data so that conclusions may be thoroughly evaluated and calculations checked.